Integrative Medicine Research xxx (xxxx) xxx

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



Integrative Medicine Research

journal homepage: www.imr-journal.com



A comparative study of the traditional medicne systems of South Korea and Taiwan: Focus on administration, education and license

Dongsu Kim ¹ a, Chun-Chuan Shih ¹ b, Hung-Chiang Cheng ¹ c, Soo-Hyun Kwon ¹ d, Hyunmin Kim ¹ e, Byungmook Lim ¹ e,*

- ^a College of Oriental Medicine, Dongshin University, Jeollanam-do, South Korea
- ^b School of Chinese Medicine for Post-Baccalaureate, I-Shou University, Kaohsiung, Taiwan
 - ^c International Affairs, The National Union of Chinese Medicine Doctor's Association, Taipei, Taiwan
 - d Guideline Center for Korean Medicine, National Institute for Korean Medicine Development, Seoul, South Korea
 - ^e Division of Humanities and Social Medicine, School of Korean Medicine, Pusan National University, South Korea

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

- Received 22 June 2020
- Received in revised form 9 September 2020
- 16 Accepted 1 October 2020
- 17 Available online xxx

Keywords:

20 Korea

25

32

33

- 21 Taiwan
- 22 Dual medical system
- Medical education
 Medical license

ABSTRACT

Background: Traditional medicine (TM) is widely used in South Korea and Taiwan, and both societies have similar systems for the management of TM. This study aimed to compare the TM systems in South Korea and Taiwan

Methods: We searched for studies on the TM systems and collected statistical data from the websites of relevant government agencies in both countries. Interviews were conducted with experts on TM and officials from government agencies. The two TM systems were described and examined in terms of policies, resources, utilization, licensing, and educational systems.

Results: Both South Korea and Taiwan have a dual system that separates the administration, licensing and educational systems between TM and Western Medicine (WM), and the TM systems are well established and highly standardized. Comparing with South Korea, however, Taiwan has a more flexible dual medical system in which education courses for producing dual licensure are provided. Additionally, in the system in Taiwan, dual license holders can use both TM and WM methods without limitations and WM doctors can apply acupuncture under some circumstances. Because of the strict dual medical system in South Korea, TM and WM conflict with each other on most health issues.

Conclusion: Both South Korea and Taiwan have the advantages of preserving TM, as TM and WM are systemically independent and together provide a more holistic approach. The institutionalization of TM in South Korea and Taiwan may be a good reference for countries considering modernization of their TM.

© 2020 Korea Institute of Oriental Medicine. Publishing services by Elsevier B.V. This is an open

access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Every country has a different system of regulation for TM^{1-3} due to the differences in their resources, 1 institutions, 1 history and culture. 3 Campbell 4 explained the differences of these systems as being defined by the policies of society, as there are discrepancies in the systematic and structured frameworks, such as political economic systems, administrative organizations, laws, and policy implementation mechanisms of the nation, which form during the process of social evolution.

Both South Korea and Taiwan have similar management systems for TM, including the therapeutic methods of acupuncture, moxibustion, cupping, herbal medicines, and manual therapies.³ The two societies have exclusive dual medical track systems for TM and WM.² TM services and herbal medicines are controlled at the government level and are reimbursed by the national health insurance.

The incorporation of TM into the healthcare system is a common phenomenon, particularly in East Asian countries, such as China, North Korea, Vietnam, Taiwan and Japan. Among these countries, South Korea and Taiwan are unique in that they have adopted a dual medical system and operate it exclusively within the scope of their licensing systems. Focusing on the organizational collaboration between TM and WM, Shim defined Japan as a subjugation system, China as an identification system, and South Korea and Taiwan as equalization systems and explained that only South

44

45

E-mail address: limb@pusan.ac.kr (B. Lim).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.imr.2020.100685

2213-4220/© 2020 Korea Institute of Oriental Medicine. Publishing services by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

Please cite this article as: D. Kim, C.-C. Shih, H.-C. Cheng et al., A comparative study of the traditional medicne systems of South Korea and Taiwan: Focus on administration, education and license, *Integr Med Res*, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.imr.2020.100685

^{*} Corresponding author at: School of Korean Medicine, Pusan National University, Yangsan Gyeongnam 626-770, South Korea.

D. Kim, C.-C. Shih, H.-C. Cheng et al.

Integrative Medicine Research xxx (xxxx) xxx

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

152

153

155

156

157

Table 1Items and contents used in the comparative analysis of TM between Taiwan and South Korea.

Items	Comparison contents
Schemes of the national health care systems	 Brief outline of the health care systems Health care indicators
Framework of TM	 Comparison of the administrative systems Comparison of the current statuses
Systems of TM	 Comparison of the educational systems Comparison of the licensing systems

TM, traditional medicine.

51

52

53

71

72

73

74

75

Korea and Taiwan have equal/dual medical systems for TM and WM.² Therefore, comparing and analyzing the systems of South Korea and Taiwan would provide a good example for countries seeking to integrate TM into their healthcare system. Previous studies were conducted to compare the TM systems of several East Asian countries³ and/or medical practices between South Korea and Taiwan.⁶ However, no in-depth comparative analysis of TM systems between South Korea and Taiwan has been conducted.

This research aimed to collect data regarding the current status of policies and resources, formal licensing and educational systems and to analyze the similarities and differences between the systems of the two societies.

2. Methods

We compared the administrative systems, resources, and organizational systems of TM in South Korea and Taiwan to analyze the institutional differences between the two countries. Specifically, we compared the administrative system of TM with the current status of its resources and utilization. Additionally, we compared the educational and licensing systems of TM in these two countries. Finally, we deduced implications for improving the systems based on an analysis of the similarities and differences between the educational and licensing systems. The data used for the institutional comparison were obtained through literature and website searches and face to face interviews. We collected the data from 2017.

The analysis was conducted based on the comparison of items and content (Table 1).

3. Results

3.1. Administration structure

The administrative organizations that manage traditional medicine are the Korean Medicine Policy and Ministry of Health and Welfare in South Korea, and Chinese Medicine department and Ministry of Health and Welfare in Taiwan. There are four departments in the Chinese Medicine department, which is larger than the Bureau of traditional Korean Medicine (Table 2).

Both departments are responsible for establishing policies related to traditional medicines, supporting research and development, cultivating human resources, and managing the distribution of herbal medicines.

The Chinese Medicine department is also in charge of the authorization and management of herbal medicine products, but in South Korea, the Ministry of Food and Drug Safety (FDA) is in charge of the approval and management of herbal medicine products.

3.2. Medical resources and utilization

In 2017, there were only five hospitals in Taiwan, and this number has been decreasing every year. In Taiwan, the number of TM doctors (6685) is one-seventh of the number of WM doctors (46,311), while the number of TM doctors in Korea is one-fifth of

that of WM doctors (TM-24,560, WM-121,571). The TM outpatient medical expenses (23,933 million TWD) in 2017 were one-24th of the WM outpatient medical expenses (577,461 million TWD) in Taiwan, whereas they were one-19th of the WM outpatient medical expenses (TM-2,541,202 million KRW, WM-47,654,799 million KRW) in South Korea. TM expenses are 3.7% of the total medical expenses in Taiwan, which was similar to 3.6% of the total medical expenses in South Korea, Additionally, the share of outpatient medical expenses was different between Taiwan and South Korea. The ratio of medical examination costs between these countries was similar (47.1% for TM in Taiwan and 34.6% for TM in South Korea). However, TM in Taiwan represented 19.4% of the treatment and examination costs and herbal medicine represented 33.4% of the total cost, but TM in Korea represented 54.3% of the treatment and examination costs and herbal medicine only represented 1.8% of the total cost. The number of outpatient visits to TM clinics in Taiwan and South Korea were similar, both approximately one-seventh of WM outpatient visits (Table 3).

3.3. Educational system

Twelve universities have TM faculty in Korea, including one specialized graduate school, while there are four universities in Taiwan that have approximately half the number of students than in Korean universities. In Taiwan, the TM educational system consists of two different courses: the TM single major/license program, which takes 7 years to complete, and the double (TM and WM) major/license program, which takes 8 years to complete. There is also a post-baccalaureate program that offers five years of TM education. This program is one year longer than the comparable university programs in Taiwan and the graduate school programs in Korea. One of the most unique features of the Taiwanese educational curriculum is the dual major course, which allows the students to obtain both a TM and a WM doctor's license. The educational curriculum for the dual license is run by the two TM universities in Taiwan (Table 4).

3.4. License system

The TM licensing systems are specified by law in both countries. Unlike South Korea, among the WM doctors who graduated from medical school before 2008, those who received a TM education and the WM doctors who graduated from the dual major university program are eligible to take the TM license examination in Taiwan. In both South Korea and Taiwan, western medical examinations, such as blood tests, can be performed by TM practitioners, although there are limits, but TM doctors are not allowed to practice WM unless they have dual licenses. A TM doctor with dual licenses in Korea is able to practice and offer both TM and WM in two different clinics simultaneously, enabling them to make health insurance claims within both medical scopes of practice. On the other hand, doctors in Taiwan can only participate in one practice, either a TM or WM clinical practice, and doctors in either practice can make insurance claims. As TM doctors are not allowed to practice WM without dual licenses in South Korea, WM doctors are not eligible to practice TM in South Korea unless they have a dual license. In Taiwan, WM doctors can practice acupuncture subsequent to a designated training program, but they cannot make insurance claims for it (Table 5).

4. Discussion

South Korea and Taiwan have similar TM systems. First, the government ministries of TM management in these countries are managed at the same level as WM.^{7,8} Second, both South Korea and Taiwan have dual medical systems that offer dual licenses and dual education systems for TM doctors, which are distinguished from

D. Kim, C.-C. Shih, H.-C. Cheng et al.

Integrative Medicine Research xxx (xxxx) xxx

Table 2Comparison of the traditional medical management systems between South Korea and Taiwan.

Index	Taiwan	South Korea	
Administrative department ¹⁹ , ²⁰	Department of Chinese Medicine in the Ministry of Health and Welfare	Bureau of traditional Korean Medicine in the Ministry of Health and Welfare	
Department organization ²⁰ , ²¹	 Four departments Division of TM Division of TM Pharmacy 	 Two departments Division of TM Policy Division of TM Industry 	
	Division of TM and Pharmacy Division of TM and Pharmacy for License Division of TM Policy Development	Division of Twi muustry	
Department responsibilities ²⁰ , ²¹	Research and development of TM management policy and related laws	Establishment and adjustment of TM related policy	
	Planning and promotion of personnel management for and policy development for medical human resources in TM	Research and development of and support for TM	
	doctors Planning of the Management Policy for TM institutions and	Training of TM doctors Support for TM public health policy	
	development of related law Management of herbal and vegetable medicines, planning of quality promotion policy and development of related law	Establishment of TM distribution management and an industry promotion policy	
	Other medicinal management related matters		

TM, traditional medicine.

Note: In Taiwan, the Department of TM in the Ministry of Health and Welfare is responsible for the approval and management of manufactured TM medicines and herbal medicines, but health insurance related to TM is handled by the Central Health Insurance Service. In South Korea, the Ministry of Food and Drug Safety is responsible for the approval and management of manufactured TM medicines and herbal medicines, but health insurance related to TM is handled by the Health Insurance Review & Assessment Service.

Table 3Comparison of the traditional medical resources and their utilization between Taiwan and South Korea in 2017.

Index		Taiwan		South Korea	
	Traditional medicine	Western medicine	Traditional medicine	Western medicine	
Number of hospitals ²² , ²³		5	478	312	1808 ^a
Number of clinics ²² , ²³		3839	11,499	14,155	30,958
Number of health care providers ²² , ²³		6685 ^b	46,311 ^b	24,560 ^c	121,571 ^c
Medical expenses, ²⁴ , ²⁵ million TWD/KRW (million USD)		23,933 (737)	577,461 ^d (17,794)	2,541,202 (2103)	47,654,799(39,433)
Share of medical expenses, ²⁴ , ²⁵	%	3.7	88.2 ^d	3.6	68.4 ^e
Share of outpatient medical	Examination	47.1	_	34.6	_
costs ^f , 25, 26 %	Procedure and checkup	19.4	-	54.3	_
	Medicine	33.4	_	1.8	_
Number of outpatient visits, ²⁴ , ²⁵ thousand cases		38,438	278,403 ^d	103,057	703,784 ^e
Shared outpatient visits, 24, 25 %		11.0	79.5 ^d	7.4	50.3 ^e

TWD, New Taiwan dollar; KRW, Korean Republic won; USD, United States dollar.

 $\P Bank\ of\ Korea.\ Exchange\ rate\ (02\ January\ 2017).\ (http://ecos.bok.or.kr/flex/EasySearch.jsp?topCode=036Y001).$

- ^a Sum of second general hospitals and general hospitals.
- ^b Based on the number of doctors.
- ^c Based on the number of licenses.
- ^d Sum of western hospitals and clinics.
- ^e Sum of tertiary general hospitals, second general hospitals, and general hospitals.

Table 4Comparison of the educational systems between Taiwan and South Korea.

Index	Taiwan	Korea
Number of universities ²¹ , ²⁶	4	12ª
Total number of students enrolled ²¹ , ²⁶	365	750 ^a
Curriculum ²¹ , ²⁶	∘ 3 types	o 2 types
	- Department of TCM after a bachelor's degree (5 years)	- Graduate school (4 years)
	- Department of TCM in a single program (7 years) - Dual degree for Chinese and western medicine (8 years)	- University of Korean medicine (6 years)
Dual course of traditional and western medicine	Yes	No
Curriculum for qualifying related medical practices	Yes (acupuncture education for western medicine)	No

TCM, traditional Chinese medicine.

158

159

160

161

162

those for WM doctors. Third, the social status of TM doctors is similar to that of WM doctors in both societies. These are all features of their dual medical systems. The dual medical system maintains the characteristics of TM, which enables it to provide a high level of service while maximizing the expertise of TM doctors, ⁹ and it expands

the range of medical services available for consumers. ⁹, ¹⁰ The dual medical system has the advantage of preserving TM, as TM and WM are systemically independent. ² On the contrary, the system may confuse the consumers when they are trying to choose the best

f The share in Taiwan is based on the total score of the relative value points, and that in Korea is based on the total medical expenses.

^a Includes 1 graduate school.

D. Kim, C.-C. Shih, H.-C. Cheng et al.

Integrative Medicine Research xxx (xxxx) xxx

Table 5Comparison of the licensing systems between Taiwan and South Korea.

Index	Taiwan	South Korea
Indicate the law for medical qualification ²⁷ , ²⁸	Yes	Yes
Medical personnel qualification ²⁹ , ³⁰	 Graduates from a TM university Among the WM doctors who graduated from medical school before 2008, those who received a TM education WM doctors who graduated from a dual major university program 	o Graduates from a TM university or TM graduate school
TM doctors' WM practice	 Allowed to conduct some examinations ³¹ Blood tests, biochemical tests, urine and feces tests, radiographic tests, ECG 	 Allowed to conduct some examinations 5 kinds of ophthalmologic medical devices ³² Blood tests, ³³ urine and feces tests ³⁴
WM doctors' TM practice	 Allowed only after 192 h of acupuncture training Insurance claims are not allowed ³⁵ 	o Not allowed
Scope of the medical practice from a dual-licensed healthcare provider	o Both medical practices are allowed	o Both medical practices are allowed
Establishment of a medical institution by a dual-licensed healthcare provider	o Only one medical institution is allowed ³⁶	o Two medical institutions are allowed
Health insurance benefits of dual-licensed healthcare provider	 Acceptance of insurance benefits only for licensed activities 	 Both are recognized, but only the main treatment is granted when the same patient is treated on the same day

TM, traditional medicine; WM, Western medicine, ECG, electrocardiogram.

medical option, and it may make the interdisciplinary convergence required by medical technology development difficult.⁹

The major difference between the systems in South Korea and Taiwan is that South Korea has a very strict distinction for licensing and medical practices between TM and WM, whereas Taiwan has some exceptions to those limitations. For example, Taiwanese universities offer a dual major for TM and WM. Additionally, in Taiwan, WM doctors can clinically practice acupuncture after receiving TM training, and TM doctors are allowed to use some WM devices to a certain extent, such as X-rays. However, in South Korea, it is illegal for WM doctors to perform acupuncture or prescribe herbal medicine or for TM doctors to use WM devices and prescribe WM drugs, and there is no additional training system available to provide the ability to use the opposing practices and drugs.

Because of this strict dual license system, there is significant conflict and social problems between the two medical professions in South Korea.^{5,9,11,12} However, there is less conflict between the two medical professions in Taiwan. The association of WM doctors asked the government to approve the use of X-rays by TM doctors in Taiwan. The low conflict observed in the dual medical system in Taiwan is likely due to it being more adjustable in allowing cooperation between the two systems.

Taiwan provides public health insurance for ancillary TM services for patients suffering from cerebrovascular diseases and tumors who are hospitalized in western hospitals. This public health insurance facilitates medical cooperation between TM doctors and WM doctors. ¹⁶ In Korea, health insurance for the integrative medical services is currently under a pilot project that is only available in some national hospitals, and it has been allowed to be used by medical service providers providing alternative care since 2010. Additionally, in Taiwan, the proportion of dual-license doctors was 5.8% of the total WM doctors and 22.7% of the total TM doctors in 2014. ¹⁴ This figure is very high in comparison to that in South Korea, where only 1.4% (319 of the total 23,460 TM doctors) are dual-license doctors. ¹⁵ It seems that the dual-licensed doctors in Taiwan are likely to play a certain role in the interpretation of the medical paradigms between the two disciplines.

However, the institutionalization of TM in South Korea is ahead of that in Taiwan. First, the South Korea government has established a law called the 'Oriental Medicine Promotion Act' for the development of TM. Based on this law, the South Korean government devises a 'Comprehensive Plan for the Development of TKM' every five years. Second, health insurance for TM medical services includes in- and out-patients, as well as automobile and industrial insurance. The rigid medical dual system of South Korea strength-

ens the foundation on which TM can be further enhanced, and it is derived from the greater degree of institutionalization of TM.

This study has the following limitations. Since we only compared two societies, it is difficult to generalize these results to social theory. Individual case analysis is relatively weak compared to cross-case analysis.¹⁷,¹⁸ In addition, social and cultural analyses were not conducted in this study. For example, the reason for the widespread use of traditional herbal medicine was not considered, even though it could be due to patients' beliefs in addition to institutional reasons.

Despite these limitations, this study is the first to analyze the education, licensing, and medical use of TM services in South Korea and Taiwan. Lijphart17 highlighted the limitations of individual case analysis studies, but they have the advantage of being able to conduct intensive and in-depth research by focusing on a single case. Therefore, it may be necessary to develop a theoretical framework of social change according to changes of TM systems on the basis of this study. Additionally, the results of this study can be used as the basis for improving TM systems and/or introducing a new system through an in-depth analysis of the systems that have had a positive effect on the development of TM in Taiwan.

In conclusion, South Korea and Taiwan have similar dual medical systems. However, Korea has a stricter dual medical system than Taiwan, which has led to serious social conflicts and difficulties in cooperation between TM and WM in South Korea. Since this study only compares two countries, it is expected that studies performed in other countries will be needed to understand the effect of the institutional separation of TM and WM on other societies in the future.

Author contributions

Conceptualization: BL and DK; Methodology: BL and DK; Software: None; Validation: None; Formal Analysis: DK; Investigation: DK, CCS, HCC, SHK and HK; Resources: DK, CCS, HCC, SHK and HK; Data Curation: DK, CCS, HCC and SHK; Writing – Original Draft: DK; Writing – Review & Editing: BL and DK; Visualization: None; Supervision: BL; Project Administration: BL; Funding Acquisition: None; Conceptualization: AA and BB. Methodology: CC, DD, and EE. Formal Analysis: AA and EE. Investigation: AA, CC, DD, and FF. Data Curation: AA. Writing – Original Draft: AA. Writing – Review & Editing: BB and GG. Supervision: GG. Funding Acquisition: BB.

D. Kim, C.-C. Shih, H.-C. Cheng et al.

Integrative Medicine Research xxx (xxxx) xxx

305

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

324

325

326

327

328

329

330

331

332

333

334

335

336

337

338

339

340

341

342

343

344

345

346

347

348

349

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

Conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Funding

253

255

256

257

258

259

260

262

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

279

281

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

This research received no grant from any funding agency.

Ethical statement

This research did not require an ethical approval as it does not involve any human or animal experiment.

Data availability

The data will be made available upon request.

02 Uncited references

13

Acknowledgments

None.

References

- 1. World Health Organization. 2014-2023 WHO Traditional medicine strategy. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization; 2013. Available from: https://www.who.int/medicines/publications/traditional/trm_strategy14_23/en/.
- Shim JM, Kim J. Cross-national differences in the holistic use of traditional East Asian medicine in East Asia. Health Promot Int 2018;33(3):536–44.
- Park HL, Lee HS, Shin BC, et al. Traditional medicine in China, Korea, and Japan: A brief introduction and comparison. Evid Based Complement Altern Med 2012:2012:9.
- 4. Campbell JL. Institutional analysis and the role of ideas in political economy. *Theory Soc* 1998;27(3):377–409.
- Park I. Adapting to a 'Biomedical world': Korean medicine (KM) doctors' biomedical knowledge and their relationship with biomedical doctors in hospital settings. Journal of Korean Society for Cultural Anthropology 2018;51(1):175–214.
- Huang CW, Hwang IH, Yun YH, et al. Population-based comparison of traditional medicine use in adult patients with allergic rhinitis between South Korea and Taiwan. J Chinese Med Assoc 2018;81(8):708–13.
- 7. Son CH, Lim S, Lee EK, et al. A Comparative analysis of the systems related to the production, authorization, and listing for insurance of herbal medicine products in south Korea and Taiwan. J Korean Orient Med Ophthalmol Otolaryngol Dermatol 2012;33(3):147–59.
- Yoon K, Kang A, Kim D, Kwon SH, Ahn B, Yang JH. Current situation and implications about relationship setting of chinese medicine and western medicine in China and Taiwan. China total research 2016.
- Yoon K, Kim D. 'Medical Unification Plan' for shared growth with modern medicine and traditional medicine in Korea. Korea Institute for Health and Affairs 2013
- Kim D, Choi BH, Lee HJ, Kwon SH, Kwon YK. Study on dual medical system of traditional chinese medicine and western medicine in Taiwan. J Physiol Pathol Korean Med 2014;28(1):9–15.
- Lim J, Yun Y, Lee S, Cho Y, Chae H. Perspectives on medical services integration among conventional western, traditional Korean, and dual-licensed medical doctors in Korea. Evid Based Complement Altern Med 2013;2013.
- 12. Moon O, Shin E, Kim E, Chun H. Comparative study on the combined oriental and western medicine in four Northeast countries. *Korean J Health Policy Adm* 2003;13(2):1–22.

- Lim EJ, Kim SY, Sohn MS, Choe PN, Oh BS. Research on the conflicts and future direction of integrative medicine in Korea. J Physiol Pathol Korean Med 2014;28(2):243–50.
- Taiwan ministry of health and welfare. Indicators on chinese medicine administration. Taipei Taiwan; 2015.
- 15. National institute for Korean medicine development, The association of Korean medicine, Pusan national university school of Korean medicine, Korea institute of oriental medicine. 2016 Year Book of Traditional Korean Medicine. Daejeon Korea. 2017.
- 16. Taiwan national health insurance administration. Health insurance pilot plan of traditional Chinese medicine medical service for inpatients of western medicine hospitals with cerebrovascular disease-2013 Negotiation reference index of health insurance benefit cost. In: administration Thii, editor, 2013.
- Lijphart A. Comparative politics and the comparative method. Am Polit Sci Rev 1971;65(3):682–93.
- Kim W, Kim J. Comparative social research methodology. Seoul Korea: Han-ul publication; 2000:13.
- Website of Taiwan Ministry of Health and Welfare. http://www.mohw. gov.tw/CHT/DOCMAP/DM1_P.aspx?f_list_no=196&fod_list_no=0&doc_no=3447. Accessed September 3, 2019.
- Website of Korea Ministry of Health and Welfare. http://www.mohw. go.kr/front.new/sg/ssg0201ls.jsp?PAR_MENU_ID=05&MENU_ID=050202& SILKUK_ID=1352023&DEPT_ID=1352026. Accessed September 3, 2018.
- Taiwan ministry of Health and Welfare. The Development of Traditional Chinese Medicine in Taiwan. Taipei, Taiwan; July 2018.
- 22. Taiwan ministry of Health and Welfare. Statistical analysis on current status medical institutions and medical services in 2017. 2018. Available from: https://dep.mohw.gov.tw/DOS/cp-4033-42732-113.html.
- 23. Korea ministry of Health and Welfare. 2018 Health and Welfare Statistical Year Book. Sejong Korea. 2018. Available from: http://www.mohw.go.kr/react/jb/sjb030301vw.jsp?PAR_MENU_ID=03&MENU_ID=032901&CONT_SEQ=347082&page=1.
- 24. Health Insurance Review & Assessment Service. 2017 statistics of health insurance spending; 2018. Available from: https://www.hira.or.kr/bbsDummy.do?pgmid=HIRAA020045030000&brdScnBltNo=4&brdBltNo=2393&pageIndex=1#none.
- Taiwan national health insurance committee and Taiwan national health insurance administration. 2017 Negotiation reference index of health insurance benefit cost. Taipei Taiwan September 2018. Available from: https://dep.mohw.gov.tw/NHIC/Ip-1665-116.html.
- https://dep.mohw.gov.tw/NHIC/Ip-1665-116.html.

 26. National institute for Korean medicine development, The association of Korean medicine, Pusan national university school of Korean medicine, Korea institute of oriental medicine. 2017 Year Book of Traditional Korean Medicine. Daejeon Korea. 2018. Available from: https://www.kiom.re.kr/brdartcl/boardarticleView.do?menu_nix=WUNNW 2Aq&brd.id=BDIDX.o9YEVvNb40b134N1Rt17aq&cont.idx=9.
- Article 10 of Taiwan medical law. Available from: https://law.moj. gov.tw/LawClass/LawAll.aspx?PCode=L0020021.
- 28. Article 2 of Korean medical law. Available from: http://www.law.go.kr/LSW//lsSc.do?section=&menuld=1&subMenuld=15&tabMenuld=81&eventGubun=060101&guery=%EC%9D%98%EB%A3%8C%EB%B2%95#undefined.
- Article 3 of Taiwan medical doctor law. Available from: https://law.moj.gov. tw/LawClass/LawAll.aspx?pcode=l0020001.
- 30. Article 5 of Korean medical law. Available from: http://www.law.go.kr/LSW//lsSc.do?section=&menuld=1&subMenuld=15&tabMenuld=81&eventGubun=060101&query=%EC%9D%98%EB%A3%8C%EB%B2%95#undefined.
- 31. Taiwan national health insurance administration. Opinions about the use of traditional Chinese medicine doctor's electrocardiography. 2018.6.4.
- 32. Constitutional Court of Korea. Decision letter: Precedent of prosecution probation measure. 2013.12.26.
- Korea ministry of health and welfare. Authoritative interpretation: Division of Korean medicine policy-2962; 2012.
- 34. Korea ministry of health and welfare. Authoritative interpretation: Division of Korean medicine policy-73; 2014.
- Taiwan ministry of health and welfare. Training course that allows western doctors and dental doctors to do acupuncture and moxibustion; 1998.
- 36. Taiwan ministry of health and welfare. Interpretation of "Dual licensed doctors (traditional Chinese medicine doctor and western medicine doctor) must select one license and register practicing."; 1995.

5